# Trophy hunting bans imperil biodiversity

Trophy hunting is under pressure: There are high-profile campaigns to ban it, and several governments have legislated against it (1). In the United States, the CECIL Act (2) would prohibit lion and elephant trophy imports from Tanzania, Zambia, and Zimbabwe and restrict imports of species listed as threatened or endangered on the Endangered Species Act. In addition to the United States, Australia, the Netherlands, and France have restricted trophy imports (1), and the United Kingdom is under pressure to follow. Calls for hunting bans usually cite conservation concerns. However, there is compelling evidence that banning trophy hunting would negatively affect conservation.

In African trophy hunting countries, more land has been conserved under trophy hunting than under National Parks (3) and ending trophy hunting risks land conversion and biodiversity loss (4). Poorly managed trophy hunting can cause local population declines (5), but unless better land-use alternatives exist, hunting reforms—which have proved effective (6)—should be prioritized over bans (7). Positive population impacts of well-regulated hunting have been demonstrated for many species, including rhinos, markhor, argali, bighorn sheep, and many African ungulates (7).

Trophy hunting can also provide income for marginalized and impoverished rural communities (7). Viable alternatives are often lacking; opponents of hunting promote the substitution of photo-tourism, but many hunting areas are too remote or unappealing to attract sufficient visitors (8). Species such as lions fare worst in areas without photo-tourism or trophy hunting (9), where unregulated killing can be far more prevalent than in hunting zones, with serious repercussions for conservation and animal welfare (10). Focusing on trophy hunting also distracts attention from the major threats to wildlife.

The International Union for Conservation of Nature (IUCN), a global conservation authority, clearly concludes that "well managed trophy hunting can—and does—positively contribute to conservation and local livelihoods" (7). Although there is considerable room for improvement, including in governance, management, and transparency of funding flows and community benefits (11), the IUCN calls for multiple steps to be taken before decisions are made that restrict or end trophy hunting programs (7). Crucially, as African countries call for a New Deal for Rural Communities (12) that allows them to achieve the self-determination to sustainably manage wildlife and reduce poverty, it is incumbent on the international community not to undermine that. Some people find trophy hunting repugnant (including many of us), but conservation policy that is not based on science threatens habitat and

biodiversity and risks disempowering and impoverishing rural communities.

Amy Dickman<sup>1,2</sup>, Rosie Cooney<sup>2,3</sup>, Paul J. Johnson<sup>1</sup>\*, Maxi Pia Louis<sup>4</sup>, Dilys Roe<sup>2,5</sup>, and 128 signatories

<sup>1</sup>Wildlife Conservation Research Unit, Department of Zoology, University of Oxford, The Recanati-Kaplan Centre, Tubney, Oxfordshire, OX13 5QL, UK. <sup>2</sup>IUCN SSC Sustainable Use and Livelihoods Specialist Group, 1196, Gland, Switzerland. <sup>3</sup>Fenner School of Environment and Society, Australian National University, 0200 ACT, Australia. <sup>4</sup>Namibian Association of CBNRM Support Organisations, Windhoek, Namibia. <sup>5</sup>Natural Resources Group, International Institute for Environment and Development, London WC1X 8NH, UK. \*Corresponding author. Email: paul.johnson@zoo.ox.ac.uk

#### REFERENCES AND NOTES

- E. Ares, "Trophy hunting," House of Commons Library Briefing Paper Number 7903 (2019); https://researchbriefings.parliament.uk/ResearchBriefing/Summary/CBP-7908
- Congress, H.R.2245—CECIL Act (2019); www.congress.gov/bill/116th-congress/house-bill/2245/text.
- A. Lindsey, P. A. Roulet, S. S. Romanach, *Biol. Conserv.* 134, 455 (2007).
- 4. E. Di Minin et al., Conserv. Biol. 27, 808 (2013).
- 5.C. Packer et al., Conserv. Biol. 25, 142 (2011).
- M. Begg, J. R. B. Miller, K. S. Begg, J. Appl. Ecol. 55, 139 (2018).
- UCN, "Informing decisions on trophy hunting" (IUCN, Gland, Switzerland, 2016).
- W. Winterbach, C. Whitesell, M. J. Somers, *PLOS One* 10, e0135595 (2015).
- 9. P. A. Lindsey et al., Biol. Conserv. 209, 137 (2017).
- A. J. Dickman, in Conflicts in Conservation: Navigating Towards Solutions,
  M. Redpath,
  R. J. Gutierrez,
  K. A. Wood,
  J. C. Young,
  Eds. (Cambridge University Press,
  Cambridge,
  2015)
  pp. 30-32.
- 11.IUCN SSC, "Guiding principles on trophy hunting as a tool for conservation incentives v 1.0 " (IUCN SSC, Gland, Switzerland, 2012).
- South Africa Trust, "Declaration—Voices of the communities: A new deal for rural communities and wildlife and natural resources" (2019); www.southernafricatrust.org/2019/06/25/declaration-voices-of-the-communities-a-new-deal-for-rural-communities-and-wildlife-and-natural-resources/.

### SUPPLEMENTARY MATERIAL

10.1126/science.aaz0735



### Supplementary Materials for

### Trophy hunting bans imperil biodiversity

Amy Dickman, Rosie Cooney, Paul J. Johnson\*, Maxi Pia Louis, Dilys Roe, and 128 signatories

\*Corresponding author. Email: paul.johnson@zoo.ox.ac.uk

Published 30 August 2019, *Science* **365**, 874 (2019) DOI: 10.1126/science.aaz0735

### This PDF file includes:

Full list of signatories

## Full list of signatories for "Trophy hunting bans imperil biodiversity" by Amy Dickman, Rosie Cooney, Paul J. Johnson, Maxi Pia Louis, Dilys Roe

- 1. Aaron Nicholas, Wildlife Conservation Society, Tanzania
- 2. Adam G. Hart, University of Gloucestershire, UK
- 3. Agostinho Jorge, Niassa Carnivore Project, Mozambique
- 4. Alayne Cotterill, Wildlife Conservation Research Unit, Department of Zoology, University of Oxford, UK
- 5. Alexandra Zimmerman, Chair, IUCN SSC Human-Wildlife Conflict Task Force
- 6. Amy Hinks, Wildlife Conservation Research Unit, Department of Zoology, University of Oxford
- 7. Amy Hinsley, Wildlife Conservation Research Unit, Department of Zoology, University of Oxford, UK
- 8. Ana Grau, Ruaha Carnivore Project, Tanzania
- 9. Andrew Jacobson, Catawba College Salisbury, NC 28144 USA.
- 10. Andrew James Hearn, Wildlife Conservation Research Unit, Department of Zoology, University of Oxford, UK
- 11. Andrew Parker, Vice President of Strategy & Programs, Africa Division, Conservation International
- 12. Angus Middleton, Executive Director, Namibia Nature Foundation, Namibia
- 13. Arash Ghoddousi, Humboldt-University Berlin, Germany
- 14. Asser Ndjiteuza, % Khaodi//Hoas Conservancy Chairperson, Namibia
- 15. Axel Moehrenschlager, Chair, IUCN Species Survival Commission Conservation Translocation Specialist Group, and Centre for Conservation Research, Calgary Zoological Society, Calgary, Alberta, Canada
- 16. BenJee Cascio, Ruaha Carnivore Project, Tanzania
- 17. Brian Child, Associate Professor, Department of Geography, Center for Africa Studies, University of Florida, USA
- 18. Byron Du Preez, Jesus College, University of Oxford, UK
- 19. Catherine E. Semcer, Research Fellow, Property and Environment Research Center, USA
- 20. Charles Jones Nsonkali, OKANI, Cameroon
- 21. Charles Jonga, Director, CAMPFIRE Association, Zimbabwe
- 22. Charlotte Searle, Wildlife Conservation Research Unit, Department of Zoology, University of Oxford, UK
- 23. Chris Brown, Namibian Chamber of Environment, representing a membership of 65 Namibian environmental NGOs
- 24. Colleen Begg, Director, Niassa Carnivore Project, Mozambique
- 25. Cory Whitney, Center for Development Research, University of Bonn, Germany
- 26. Craig Packer, Director, Lion Research Center, University of Minnesota, USA
- 27. Damian Bell, Honeyguide, Tanzania
- 28. Dan Challender, Oxford Martin Fellow, Oxford Martin Programme on the Illegal Wildlife Trade, Department of Zoology, University of Oxford, UK
- 29. David Mallon, Co-Chair, IUCN Species Survival Commission, Antelope Specialist Group; Manchester Metropolitan University, UK

- 30. Debbie Peake, Botswana Coalition for Conservation, Ngamiland Council of Non-Governmental Organisations and Botswana Wildlife Producers Association
- 31. Diogo Veríssimo, Department of Zoology and Oxford Martin School, University of Oxford, UK & Institue for Conservation and Research, San Diego Zoo, USA
- 32. Dominik T. Bauer, Wildlife Conservation Research Unit, Department of Zoology, University of Oxford, UK
- 33. Duan Biggs, Griffith University, Queensland, Australia
- 34. Ed Sayer, Country Director & Programme Manager, Frankfurt Zoological Society Zambia
- 35. Edson Gandiwa, School of Wildlife, Ecology and Conservation, Chinhoyi University of Technology, Zimbabwe
- 36. EJ Milner-Gulland, Director, Interdisciplinary Centre for Conservation Science, Department of Zoology, University of Oxford, UK
- 37. Elizabeth L. Bennett, Vice President, Species Conservation, Wildlife Conservation Society, USA
- 38. Enrico Di Minin, Department of Geosciences and Geography, University of Helsinki, Finland
- 39. Eric Xaweb, Tsiseb Conservancy Manager, Namibia
- 40. Gail Potgieter, Felines Communication and Conservation Consultants, Namibia
- 41. George Wambura, CEO Community Wildlife Management Areas Consortium (CWMAC), Tanzania
- 42. Gerhard R Damm, Conservation Frontlines Foundation
- 43. Ghulam Mohd Malikyar, Environmental Analyst, Afghanistan
- 44. Haibin Wang, Ph.D., China Wildlife Conservation Association
- 45. Hans de Iongh, Leo Foundation
- 46. Harriet T. Davies-Mostert, Endangered Wildlife Trust, South Africa and Mammal Research Institute, University of Pretoria, South Africa
- 47. Himla Angula, NACSO Institutional Support Coordinator, Namibia
- 48. Hollie Booth, University of Oxford, UK
- 49. Holly Dublin, Member, IUCN Sustainable Use and Livelihoods Specialist Group
- 50. Hongjie Wang, Vice President, China Wildlife Conservation Association
- 51. Hugo van der Westhuizen, Gonarezhou Conservation Trust, Zimbabwe
- 52. Isla Duporge, Wildlife Conservation Research Unit, Department of Zoology, University of Oxford, UK
- 53. James Stevens, Member, IUCN SSC Human-Wildlife Conflict Task Force
- 54. Janet Matoka, Assistant Director, Integrated Rural Development and Nature Conservation, Namibia
- 55. Janusz Sielicki, Vicepresident, International Association for Falconry and Conservation of Birds of Prey
- 56. Jenny Anne Glikman, Member, IUCN SSC Human-Wildlife Conflict Task Force
- 57. Jeremy Cusack, Biological and Environmental Sciences, University of Stirling, UK
- 58. John Kasaona, Executive Director, Integrated Rural Development and Nature Conservation, Namibia
- 59. Juan Herrero, Co-chair, IUCN SSC Caprinae Specialist Group; and Technical School, University of Saragossa, Spain
- 60. Judie Melikie, Huab Conservancy Chairperson, Namibia
- 61. Julia Jones, University of Bangor, UK

- 62. Julian Fennessy, Director, Giraffe Conservation Foundation, Namibia
- 63. Juliette Claire Young, NERC Centre for Ecology and Hydrology, UK
- 64. Julius G. Bright Ross, Wildlife Conservation Research Unit, Department of Zoology, University of Oxford, UK
- 65. Justin Brashares, Department of Environmental Science, Policy, and Management, UC Berkeley, USA
- 66. Justin Seymour-Smith, Trans-Kalahari Predator Programme, Wildlife Conservation Research Unit, University of Oxford, UK
- 67. Karen Laurenson, Interim Director, Africa Department, Frankfurt Zoological Society
- 68. Keith Somerville, Durrell Institute of Conservation and Ecology, University of Kent, UK
- 69. Khalil Karimov, Tajikistan Snow Leopard Programme Field Scientist; Central Asia Regional Chair, IUCN Sustainable Use and Livelihoods Specialist Group
- 70. Kim S Jacobsen, Wildlife Conservation Research Unit, Department of Zoology, University of Oxford, UK
- 71. Korsh Ararat, Nature Iraq/University of Sulaimani, Iraq
- 72. Laura Perry, Wildlife Conservation Research Unit, Department of Zoology, University of Oxford, UK
- 73. Lisanne Petracca, Conservation Scientist, Panthera, USA
- 74. Liz Rihoy, Director, Resource Africa UK
- 75. Lovemore Sibanda, Wildlife Conservation Research Unit, Department of Zoology, University of Oxford, UK
- Luke Dollar, Department of Environment & Sustainability, Catawba College Salisbury, NC 28144 USA
- 77. Luke Hunter, Executive Director, Big Cats Program, Wildlife Conservation Society, USA
- 78. Marco Festa-Bianchet, Département de biologie, Université de Sherbrooke, Canada
- 79. Marco Pani, Member, IUCN Sustainable Use and Livelihoods Specialist Group
- 80. Marion Valeix, Laboratoire de Biométrie et Biologie Evolutive, Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique (CNRS), Université de Lyon, France
- 81. Mark Stanley-Price, Wildlife Conservation Research Unit, Department of Zoology, University of Oxford, UK
- 82. Mathew Bukhi Mabele, Department of Geography and Environmental Studies, University of Dodoma, Tanzania
- 83. Matthew Becker, CEO, Zambian Carnivore Programme, Zambia
- 84. Matthew Wijers, Wildlife Conservation Research Unit, Department of Zoology, University of Oxford, UK
- 85. Michael Archer, PANGEA Research Center, School of Biological, Earth & Environmental Sciences, University of New South Wales, Sydney, Australia
- 86. Michael 't Sas-Rolfes, School of Geography and the Environment and Oxford Martin School, University of Oxford, UK
- 87. Mike Hoffmann, Head, Global Conservation Programmes, Zoological Society of London, UK
- 88. Mike Knight, Chair, IUCN SSC African Rhino Specialist Group
- 89. Mohammad Farhadinia, Oxford Martin School, University of Oxford, UK
- 90. Moses Selebatso, Wildlife Ecologist, Kalahari Research and Conservation, Botswana
- 91. Munavvar Alidodov, President, Association of Nature Conservation Organisations of Tajikistan

- 92. Nafeesa Esmail, Oxford Martin School & Department of Zoology, University of Oxford, UK
- 93. Niall Hammond, Griffith University, Queensland, Australia
- 94. Niki Rust, School of Natural & Environmental Sciences, Newcastle University, UK
- 95. Nils Bunnefeld, Professor in Conservation Science, Biological and Environmental Sciences, University of Stirling, UK
- 96. Nyambe Nyambe, Executive Director, Kavango-Zambezi Transfrontier Conservation Area
- 97. Paolo Strampelli, Wildlife Conservation Research Unit, Department of Zoology, University of Oxford, UK
- 98. Paolo Wilfred, Department of Life Sciences, Open University of Tanzania
- 99. Peadar Brehony, University of Cambridge, UK
- 100. Pete Coppolillo, Executive Director, Working Dogs for Conservation, USA
- 101. Peter Coals, Wildlife Conservation Research Unit, Department of Zoology, University of Oxford, UK; School of Animal, Plant & Environmental Science, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, South Africa
- 102. Peter Tyrrell, Wildlife Conservation Research Unit, Department of Zoology, University of Oxford, UK
- 103. Peyton West, Executive Director, Frankfurt Zoological Society U.S.
- 104. Philippe Chardonnet, Co-Chair, IUCN Species Survival Commission, Antelope Specialist Group
- 105. Rebecca Klein, Cheetah Conservation Botswana
- 106. Richard W. S. Fynn, Okavango Research Institute, University of Botswana
- 107. Rob Morley, Flora Fauna & Man
- 108. Robert Kenward, Chair for Sustainable Use and Management of Ecosystems in IUCN Commission on Ecosystem Management
- 109. Robert Thomson, Felines Communication and Conservation Consultants, Namibia
- 110. Robin Sharp, retired Director of Wildlife and Countryside, UK Department of Environment
- 111. Rodgers Lubilo, Chairperson, Zambia Community-Based Natural Resources Management (CBNRM) Forum
- 112. Rosalie Iileka, Namibia Nature Foundation
- 113. Ruth Feber, Wildlife Conservation Research Unit, Department of Zoology, University of Oxford, UK
- 114. Sándor Csányi, Institute for Wildlife Conservation, Szent István University, Hungary
- 115. Sandro Lovari, Co-Chair, IUCN Caprinae Specialist Group; and Maremma Natural History Museum, Grosseto, Italy
- 116. Sarah Durant, Institute of Zoology, Zoological Society of London, UK
- 117. Shadrach Mwaba, Zambian Carnivore Programme and Wildlife Conservation Research Unit, Department of Zoology, University of Oxford, UK
- 118. Simon Hedges, Asian Arks; Lao PDR; IUCN SSC Human-Wildlife Conflict Task Force
- 119. Simon Pooley, Department of Geography, Birkbeck University of London, UK
- 120. Stefan Michel, IUCN Caprinae Specialist Group, IUCN Sustainable Use and Livelihoods Specialist Group
- 121. Stein Katupa, Kunene Conservancy Regional Association Secretary, Namibia
- 122. Stephen Redpath, University of Aberdeen, UK

- 123. Sugoto Roy, Member, IUCN SSC Human-Wildlife Conflict Task Force
- 124. Teo Ntinda, Namibia Development Trust, Namibia
- 125. Tim Tear, Executive Director, Africa Program, Wildlife Conservation Society, USA
- 126. Vanessa M Adams, Discipline of Geography and Spatial Sciences, University of Tasmania, Australia
- 127. Vernon Booth, Member, IUCN Sustainable Use and Livelihoods Specialist Group
- 128. Wei Jl, Member, IUCN Sustainable Use and Livelihoods Specialist Group